

The Old and New Tibetan Translations of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra* : Some Notes on the History of Early Tibetan Translation*

Noriaki Hakamaya

a) Introduction

Up to now, very little has been known about the actual history of the early Tibetan translation of Buddhist texts because the extant Tibetan Canon preserves only one version of each text as a general rule. Most of these Buddhist texts were translated after the year of skad gsar bcad¹⁾ or were emended by skad gsar bcad. Recently, however, we have begun to learn something about the actual situation of early Tibetan translation before skad gsar bcad through the Tibetan manuscripts from Tun-huang.

The purpose of this paper is to analyse and compare the old Tibetan translation of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra* with the new translation preserved in the extant Tibetan bKa' 'gyur, and to add some comments about the history of early Tibetan translation based on this comparison.

* This paper was read at the 31st CISHAAN meeting (Sept. 6, 1983).

1) The term skad gsar bcad means "the finally decided [translation] words [system]" and is supposed to have been established in A. D. 814 (Refer to Zuiho Yamaguchi, "A Chronological Research for the History of Buddhism in the Ancient Tibetan Kingdom" (in Japanese), *Naritasan Bukkyōkenkyūsho Kiyō*, No. 3 (1978), pp. 1-52, and "A study of the *sGra sbyor bam po gnyid pa*" (in Japanese), *ibid.*, No. 4 (1979), pp. 1-24). In this paper, we call the Tibetan translation before skad gsar bcad the old one in contrast to the new one which follows skad gsar bcas.

(2)

b) Stein Tib. No. 194 and No. 683

Stein Tib. No. 194²⁾ is a manuscript of the old Tibetan translation of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra*, which consists of 49 folios. Though these folios are in disorder, they can be easily read in order with the help of a catalogue edited by the Seminar on Tibet³⁾. In addition to these 49 folios, I have identified Stein Tib. No. 683 as one folio of the same manuscript as Stein Tib. No. 194, which connects with folio 37 of Stein Tib. No. 194 numbered by the India Office Library, although Prof. Poussin judged it to be a fragment of a treatise on tri-svabhāva or tri-lakṣaṇa⁴⁾. These 50 folios should be arranged in the following order, accompanied with the location numbers in the Peking edition⁵⁾ and Lamotte's edition⁶⁾. The letters A to W indicate the groups separated by missing portions.

Regular order	Folio of S. 194	P(eking ed.)	L(amotte's ed.)
A	1	46	2b8-3b1
Intro., §4, 1. 5-I, §2, 1. 5 (Lacuna: P. 3b1-4b3, L. I, §2, 1. 5-§4, 1. 31)			
B	2	62	4b3-5a3
I, §4, 1. 31-§5, 1. 16 (Lacuna: P. 5a3-7b8, L. I, §5, 1. 16-III, §3, 1. 3)			
C	3	40	7b8-8a8
III, §3, 1. 3-1. 30 (Lacuna: P. 8a8-13a3, L. III, §3, 1. 30-V, §1, 1. 2)			
D	4	44	13a3-b3
V, §1, 1. 2-§2, 1. 10 (Lacuna: P. 13b3-14a1, L. V, §2, 1. 10-§4, 1. 13)			
E	5	47	14a1-8
V, §4, 1. 13-§5, 1. 15			

2) Lois de la Vallée Poussin, *Catalogue of the Tibetan Manuscripts from Tunhuang in the India Office Library* (Oxford, 1962), pp. 69-70.

3) Zuiho Yamaguchi and others, *A Catalogue of the Tibetan Manuscripts Collected by Sir Aurel Stein*, Part II (Tokyo, 1978), pp. 128-129.

4) Poussin, *op. cit.*, p. 219.

5) *The Tibetan Tripitaka*, Vol. 29, No. 774, Ngu, 1-60b7.

6) É. Lamotte, *Samdhinirmocana Sūtra: L'Explication des Mystères* (Louvain-Paris, 1935). This is based on the Narthang ed.

	6	58	14a8-b6	V, §5, 1. 15-§6, 1. 17
	7	63	14b6-15a6	V, §6, 1. 17-VI, §2, 1. 4
	8	64	15a6-b7	VI, §2, 1. 4-§7, 1. 6
	9	65	15b7-16a6	VI, §7, 1. 6-§9, 1. 2
	10	66	16a6-b8	VI, §9, 1. 2-§11, 1. 11
	(Lacuna : P. 16b8-17a8, L. VI, §11, 1. 11-VII, §1, 1. 1)			
F	11	41	17a8-b8	VII, §1, 11. 1-26
	12	37	17b8-18b3	VII, §1, 1. 26-§5, 1. 1
	13	[S. No. 683]	18b3-19a3	VII, §5, 1. 1-§7, 1. 8
	(Lacuna : P. 19a3-b2, L. VII, §7, 1. 8-§9, 1. 8)			
G	14	56	19b2-20a2	VII, §9, 1. 8-§10, 1. 17
	(Lacuna : P. 20a2-22b7, L. VII, §10, 1. 17-§20, 1. 13)			
H	15	39	22b7-23a8	VII, §20, 1. 13-§22, 1. 4
	16	43	23a8-b7	VII, §22, 1. 4-§23, 1. 15
	(Lacuna : P. 23b7-24a6, L. VII, §23, 1. 15-§24, 1. 15)			
I	17	35	24a6-b5	VII, §24, 1. 15-§25, 1. 18
	(Lacuna : P. 24b5-25a6, L. VII, §25, 1. 18-§26, 1. 8)			
J	18	53	25a6-b5	VII, §26, 1. 8-§27, 1. 5
	19	33	25b5-26a5	VII, §27, 1. 5-§28, 1. 6
	(Lacuna : P. 26a5-28b8, L. VII, §28, 1. 6-VIII, §4, 1. 2)			
K	20	31	28b8-29b3	VIII, §4, 1. 2-§7, 1. 13
	(Lacuna : P. 29b3-31b6, L. VIII, §7, 1. 13-§16, 1. 1)			
L	21	55	31b6-32a6	VIII, §16, 1. 1-§18, 1. 1
	(Lacuna : P. 32a6-35a5, L. VIII, §18, 1. 1-§23, 1. 13)			
M	22	26	35a5-b4	VIII, §23, 1. 13-§24, 1. 15
	23	29	35b4-36a4	VIII, §24, 1. 15-§26, 1. 10
	24	27	36a4-b5	VIII, §26, 1. 10-§29, 1. 9
	25	57	36b5-37a4	VIII, §29, 11. 9-38
	26	30	37a4-b4	VIII, §29, 1. 38-§31, 1. 6
	27	32	37b4-38a3	VIII, §31, 1. 6-§32, 1. 15
	(Lacuna : P. 38a4-b3, L. VIII, §32, 1. 15-§33, 1. 21)			

(4)

N	28	42	38b3-39a3	VIII, §33, 1. 21-§35, 1. 4
	29	28	39a3-b3	VIII, §35, 1. 4-§36, 1. 7
(Lacuna : P. 39b3-43a6, L. VIII, §36, 1. 7-IX, §3, 1. 9)				
O	30	49	43a6-b5	IX, §3, 11. 9-38
(Lacuna : P. 43b5-44b8, L. IX, §3, 1. 38-§5, 1. 6)				
P	31	50	44b5-45a7	IX, §5, 11. 6-48
(Lacuna : P. 45a7-b6, L. IX, §5, 1. 49-§6, 1. 12)				
Q	32	38	45b6-46a6	IX, §6, 1. 13-§8, 1. 8
	33	51	46a6-b5	IX, §8, 1. 8-§9, 1. 31
	34	36	46b5-47a4	IX, §9, 1. 31-§10, 1. 4
	35	60	47a4-b3	IX, §10, 1. 4-1. 35
	36	45	47b3-48a1	IX, §10, 1. 35-§12, 1. 10
	37	24	48a1-b1	IX, §12, 1. 10-§14, 1. 2
(Lacuna : P. 48b1-49a7, L. IX, §14, 1. 2-§18, 1. 23)				
R	38	34	49a7-b7	IX, §18, 11. 23-62
	39	61	49b7-50a4	IX, §18, 11. 62-91
(Lacuna : P. 50a4-51a3, L. IX, §18, 1. 92-§22, 1. 10)				
S	40	25	51a3-b1	IX, §22, 1. 10-§25, 1. 6
(Lacuna : P. 51b1-53b2, L. IX, §25, 1. 6-§34, 1. 11)				
T	41	18	53b2-54a1	X, §1, 1. 1-§3, 1. 3
	42	19	54a1-8	X, §3, 1. 3-§5, 1. 8
(Lacuna : P. 54a8-b7, L. X, §5, 11. 8-56)				
U	43	22	54b7-55a7	X, §5, 1. 56-§7, 1. 4
(Lacuna : P. 55a7-56b2, L. X, §7, 11. 4-109)				
V	44	52	56b2-57a1	X, §7, 11. 109-150
	45	59	57a1-6	X, §7, 11. 150-178
	46	48	57a6-b5	X, §7, 11. 178-212
	47	21	57b5-58a4	X, §7, 1. 212-§8, 1. 14
(Lacuna : P. 58a4-b3, L. X, §8, 11. 14-50)				
W	48	23	58b3-59a3	X, §9, 11. 1-28
	49	54	59a3-b3	X, §9, 1. 28-§10, 1. 22

(Lacuna: P. 60a2-b7, L. X, §11, 1. 10-§13, 1. 18)

These 50 folios are about 42 percent of the extant entire new Tibetan translation (the bKa' 'gyur version) of this sūtra, and about 70 folios seem to be missing from the manuscript of the old translation containing Stein Tib. No. 194 and No. 683. Because the first and last folios belong to missing portions, the title of the old translation of this sūtra has not been known. However, according to Satoru Harada, the title is undoubtedly supposed to be *Bar mtshams ma las par 'grel pa* based on quotations of this sūtra in an old Tibetan translation of the first *Bhāvanākrama* (Stein Tib. No. 648, f. 127a1, 5, f. 133a8)⁷⁾. It is known that Pelliot Tib. No. 615 is also a fragment of a Tibetan translation of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra*, but it has the title *dGongs pa nges par 'grel pa*⁸⁾. Therefore we do not regard it as part of the old Tibetan translation and this paper does not deal with it as such.

c) Comparison between the Old and New Tibetan Translations along with the Chinese Versions

We have given a table comparing the Stein Tib. Nos. 194 and 683 with the Peking and Lamotte editions. Now we are going to present some examples in which we compare the old Tibetan translation (Nos. 194 and 683) with the new one (Peking ed. and Lamotte's ed.) and include

7) Satoru Harada, "Analysis of the Tun-huang Manuscripts of the *sGom rim dang po*" (in Japanese), *Report of the Japanese Association for Tibetan Studies*, No. 28 (1982), pp. 4-8, in which Harada points out that the name of Bodhisattva Zab mo'i dond *bar mtshams ma las par 'grel pa* in this old Tibetan translation of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra* (Stein Tib. No. 194, f. 46a3-4) corresponds to Don zab *dgongs pa nges par 'grel pa* in the new translation (P. ed., Ngu, 3a3, Lamotte's ed., p. 34, 1. 12), and he concludes that the old Tibetan translation of the first *Bhāvanākrama* took place after or before A. D. 794, the year of the Council of bSam yas.

8) M. Lalou, *Inventaire des manuscrits tibétains de Touen-houang conservés à la Bibliothèque Nationale*, I (Paris, 1939), p. 139.

(6)

the Chinese translations of this sūtra.

Example 1

yod pa de ni sgyus byas pa'o/ yod
pa de ni myig 'khrul pa ste/ gang
du bal glang du 'du shes zhugs
pa'o// bal glang gyi gzugs gyi
gzhung du 'du shes sam zhes bya
ba nas nor dang 'bru dang bang ba
dang mdzod du 'du shesu 'jug [pa
dang] de dag gi gzhung du 'du
shes sam bya ba'i bar du ste/

de dag gis de la ji ltar mthong
ba'am ji ltar thos pa ltar ma yind
de nan gyis reg ching chags par
myi smra ba ni 'di nyid bden gyi
gzhan ni gti mug ces so/ smra yang
ji ltar don chud pa'i phyir gyi/ de
la dagis phyis nye bar brtag par
'gyur ba ma yin no//

(No. 194. f. 62a2-5)

gang la glang po che'i tshogs kyi
'du shes dang/ glang po che'i
tshogs kyi rnam grangs kyi 'du
shes 'byung ba dang/ nor dang 'bru
dang mdzod dang bang ba'i tshogs
kyi bar gyi 'du shes dang/ de dag
gi rnam grangs kyi 'du shes 'byung
ba sgyu ma byas pa 'di ni yod/
mig slu bar byed pa 'di ni yod do
snyam du sems shing/

de dag ji ltar mthong ba dang ji
ltar thos pa bzhin du de la nan
gyis mchog tu bzung zhing mngon
par zhen nas 'di ni bden gyi gzhan
ni brdzun pa'o zhes rjes su tha
snyad mi 'dogs kyi/ 'di ltar don
rnam par rig par bya ba'i phyir
rjes su tha snyad 'dogs par byed
de/ de ni de dag gis phyis nye bar
brtag par bya mi dgos pa yin no//

(P. 4b4-7: L. p. 37, I, §4, 11. 34-44)

List of the old Tib. tr. words equivalent to the new ones

(Skt. words follow Lamotte's given in his edition)

1. sgyus byas pa : sgyu ma byas pa (māyā-kṛta);
2. myig 'khrul pa : mig slu bar byed pa (cakṣur-vañcana);
3. bal glang : glang po che (hastin);
4. gzugs : tshogs (kāya);
5. gzhung du 'du shes : rnam grangs kyi 'du shes (paryāya-saṃjñā);
6. nan gyis reg ching chags pa : nan gyis mchog tu bzung zhing mngon par zhen (āsajya abhiniviśya);
7. gti mug : brdzun pa (moha);
8. chud pa : rnam par rig par bya ba (vijñapti)

玄奘譯 然有幻狀，迷惑眼事。於中發起，大眾身想，或大象身差別之想。不如所見，不如所聞，堅固執著，隨起言說，唯此諦實，餘皆愚妄。為欲表知，如是義故，亦於此中，隨起言說。彼於後時，不須觀察。(大正16, 689b)

菩提流支譯 此幻所作，有此象馬車步兵等虛妄之想，種種異事，幻惑人眼。彼智慧人，如所見聞，不取為實，亦不執著。亦不取此，畢竟為實，餘者虛妄。而知為義，取彼言語。此人不須更觀勝法。(大正16, 666b)

真諦譯 象馬等物，及以庫藏，是人若見若聞，隨能隨力，不著見聞，作如是言，如我所思，此是真實，異此非實。雖隨世言，為顯實義。是人不須重更思惟。(大正16, 712a)

Example 2

'on te de 'du byed gyi mtsan nyid
las/ dond dam pa'i mtsan nyid
gzhan yin na/ des ni bden ba
mthong ba dag gyis gyang/ 'du
byed kyis mtsan nyid zild kyis myi
nond par 'gyuro/

'du byed kyis mtsan nyid las kyang
rnam par ma grol/ mtshan ma'i
bcings pa las kyang ma grol ba yin/
de bden ba mthong ba de/ mtsan
ma'i bcings pa las ma grol/ nyes
pa sbom po'i bcings pa las gyang
ma grol bar 'gyuro/

(No. 194, f. 40a2-4)

gal te 'du byed kyis mtshan nyid
dang don dam pa'i mtshan nyid
tha dad pa yin par gyur na ni/ des
na bden pa mthong ba rnam kyang
'du byed kyis mtshan ma dang ma
bral bar 'gyur/

'du byed kyis mtshan ma dang ma
bral ba'i phyir bden pa mthong ba
mtshan ma'i 'ching ba las rnam
par grol bar yang mi 'gyur/
mtshan ma'i 'ching ba las rnam
par ma grol na/ gnas ngan len gyi
'ching ba las kyang rnam par ma
grol bar 'gyur/ (P. 8a1-3: L. p. 43,
III, §3, 11. 7-14)

List of the Tib. tr. words equivalent to the new ones

1. zild kyis myi nond par 'gyur: ma bral bar 'gyur; 2. nyes pa sbom po'i bcings pa: gnas ngan len gyi 'ching ba (dauṣṭhulya-bandhana)

玄奘譯 若勝義諦相，與諸行相，一向異者，已見諦者，於諸行相，應不除遣。若不除遣諸行相者，應於相縛，不得解脫，此見諦者，於諸相縛，不解脫故，於籠重縛，亦應不脫。(大正16, 690b)

(8)

菩提流支譯 若有爲行相是有相者，相卽是縛，不應得解脫。若見實諦，不離相縛者，不應得解。亦不得脫煩惱之縛。(大正16, 667b)

真諦譯 若真如相，異於行相，一切聖人已見真如，則應不能伏滅行相。由不伏滅諸行相故。雖見真諦，不能解脫衆相繫縛。若於衆相不得解脫，亦不解脫龜重繫縛。(大正16, 713a)

Example 3

shin du rnam par dag par bye brag
phyed pa/ de'i phyir na/ ma rabs
ni bden pa mthong ba ma yin/ ma
rabsu gyurd pa nyid/ bla na myed
pa'i thub pa bde ba mye ngan las
'das pa thob par myi 'gyuro/

bla na myed pa'i gyung drung
rdzogs pa'i byang chub du yang
mngon par 'tshang myi rgya'o//
de bas na 'du byed gyi mtshan nyid
las/ don dam pa'i mtsan nyid gzhan
ma yin zhes byar myi rung ngo//
(No. 194, f. 40a6-b2)

blo gros shin tu rnam dag gang
gi phyir so so'i skye bo bden pa
mthong ba ma yin/ so so'i skye
bo kho nar gyur bzhin du grub pa
dang/ bde ba bla na med pa'i mya
ngan las 'das pa 'thob par yang
mi 'gyur/

bla na med pa yang dag par rdzogs
pa'i byang chub mngon par rdzogs
par 'tshang rgya bar mi 'gyur ba
de'i phyir 'du byed kyi mtshan nyid
dang/ don dam pa'i mtshan nyid
tha dad pa ma yin zhes byar myi
rung ste/ (P. 8a4-6: L. pp. 43-44, III,
§3, 11. 17-23)

List of the old Tib. tr. words equivalent to the new ones

1. Shin du rnam par dag par bye brag phyed pa: Blo gros shin tu rnam dag (Suviśuddhamati); 2. ma rabs: so so'i skye bo (pṛthgjana); 3. thub pa bde ba: bde ba (yogakṣema); 4. gyung drung rdzogs pa'i byang chub: yang dag par rdzogs pa'i byang chub (samyak-saṃbodhi)

玄奘譯 善清淨慧。由於今時，非諸異生皆已見諦，非諸異生已能獲得無上方便安隱涅槃，亦非已證阿耨多羅三藐三菩提。是故，勝義諦相，與諸行相，都無異相，不應道理。(大正16, 690b-c)

菩提流支譯 善清淨慧。以是義故，愚癡凡夫不見實諦，亦非卽此凡夫之身得彼無上清淨涅槃，亦非卽彼凡夫之身能得阿耨多羅三藐三菩提。是故……有爲行相第一

義相，一(異)之義，不成一(異)。(大正16, 667b-c)

眞諦譯 淨慧。由，諸凡夫不見眞如，在凡夫位，不得無上如安涅槃，亦不能得無上菩提。以是義故，眞如之理，與諸行一，是義不然。(大正16, 713a)

Example 4

'ond te thang chig du lnga'i bar
du rnam par shes pha mang po
byung ba'i rkyend nye bar 'dug
par gyurd na// thang chig du
lnga'i rnam par shes pa mang po
dag 'jug par 'gyuro//

yangs pa bye brag phyed pha de
ltar byang chub sems dpa' chos
'dug pa'i ye shes la brten (brtan,
sic) ching chos 'dug pa'i ye shes
la gna'as pa ni/ sems dang yid
dang rnam par shes pa'i gsang ba
la mkhas par 'gyur mod kyi/ yang
dag par gshegs pas thams shad (/)
gyis yang thams shad gyi sems
dang yid dang rnam par shes pa'i
gsang ba la mkhas pa'i byang chub
sems dpha'ar ni/ gdag'as shing myi
bsngo'o// (No. 194, f. 58a1-b1)

gal te rnam par shes pa'i tshogs
lnga car gyi bar dag lhan cig
'byung ba'i rkyen nye bar gnas
par gyur na yang rnam par shes
pa'i tshogs lnga car lhan cig 'byung
ngo//

blo gros yangs pa de ltar byang
chub sems dpa' chos kyi lugs shes
pa la brten cing chos kyi lugs shes
pa la gnas nas/ sems dang yid dang
rnam par shes pa'i gsang ba la
mkhas pa yin yang de bzhin gshegs
pa ni byang chub sems dpa' sems
dang yid dang rnam par shes pa'i
gsang ba la mkhas par 'dogs na de
tsam gyis thams cad kyi thams cad
du mi 'dogs so// (P. 14b1-3: L. p. 57,
V, §5, 1. 17-§6, 1. 6)

List of the old Tib. tr. words equivalent to the new ones

1. thang chig: lhan cig; 2. nye bar 'dug pa: nye bar gnas pa (pratyupasthita); 3. Yangs pa bye brag phyed pha: Blo gros yangs pa (Viśālamati); 4. 'dug pa'i ye shes: lugs shes pa (nīti-jñāna); 5. yang dag par gshegs pa: de bzhin gshegs pa (tathāgata)

玄奘譯 若於爾時，乃至有五識身，生緣現前，即於此時，五識身轉。廣慧。如是，菩薩，雖，由法住智，爲依止，爲建立故，於心意識，祕密善巧，然，諸如來，不，齊於此，施設彼，爲於心意識一切祕密善巧菩薩。(大正16, 692c)

(10)

菩提流支譯 廣慧。若五識身，五種因緣，一時現前，無分別意識，即共五識，一時取境。廣慧。如是，菩薩摩訶薩，依法住智，如實善知心意意識深密之法。廣慧。而佛不說，諸菩薩等，是善解知心意意識深密之法。(大正16, 669b)

Example 5

yon tan 'byung gna'as de la mtshan
ma dang/ mying gyis zind pas rkyen
byas pas na'a/ kund du rtog pa'i
mtshan nyid du rab du shes so//
gzhan gyi dbang las mtshan nyid
la kund du rtog pa'i mtshan nyid
chags pas rkyen byas pas na'a/
gzhan gyi dbang las mtshan nyid
du rab du shes so//
gzhan gyi dbang las mtshan nyid
la kund du rtog pa'i mtshan nyid
ma chags [pas] rkyend byas pas
na'a yongs su rdzogs pa'i mtshan
nyid rab du shes so// (No. 194, f.
66a4-b2)

yon tan 'byung gnas de la mtshan
ma dang 'brel ba'i ming la brten
nas ni kun brtags pa'i mtshan
nyid rab tu shes so//
gzhan gyi dbang gi mtshan nyid la
kun brtags pa'i mtshan nyid du
mngon par zhen pa la brten nas
ni gzhan gyi dbang gi mtshan nyid
rab tu shes so//
gzhan gyi dbang gi mtshan nyid la
kun brtags pa'i mtshan nyid du
mngon par zhen pa med pa la brten
nas ni yongs su grub pa'i mtshan
nyid rab tu shes so// (P. 16b3-5: L.
p. 63, VI, §10, 11. 1-7)

List of the old Tib. tr. words equivalent to the new ones

1. rkyen(d) byas pas na'a: brten nas (niśritya); 2. kund du rtog pa'i mtshan nyid: kun brtags pa'i mtshan nyid (parikalpita-lakṣaṇa); 3. gzhan gyi dbang las mtshan nyid: gzhan gyi dbang gi mtshan nyid (paratantra-lakṣaṇa); 4. yongs su rdzogs pa'i mtshan nyid: yongs su grub pa'i mshan nyid (pariniṣpanna-lakṣaṇa)

玄奘譯 復次，德本。相名相應，以為緣故，遍計所執相，而可了知。依他起相上，遍計所執相，執以為緣故，依他起相，而可了知。依他起相上，遍計所執相，無執以為緣故，圓成實相，而可了知。(大正16, 693b)

菩提流支譯 應知，功德林，而依名相因緣，分別因緣相。應知，功德林，依虛妄因緣，執著名相，是故見他力因緣。功德林，依他力因緣，執著虛妄分別之相，見第一義相。(大正16, 670a)

Example 6

yang dond dam gyung drung 'phags/
chos rnam gyi mtshan nyid la/ ngo
bo nyid myed pa gang zhe na/ gang
kund du rtog pa'i mtshan nyid do//

de ji'i phyir zhe na/ de ltar mying
dang mtshan ma'i phyir btags pa'i
mtshan ma yind gyi/ bdagi mtshan
ma nyid gyis btags pa ni ma yin
no// de bas na de'i mtshan nyid
la ngo bo nyid myed ces bya'o//

yang don dam gyung drung 'phags
(No. 683) chos rnam gyi skye ba
la ngo bo nyid myed pa gang zhe
na/ gang chos rnam gyi gzhan
gyi dbang las mtshan nyid do// de
ji'i phyir zhe na/ de ltar de gzhan
gyi rkyend gyi dbang gyis 'gyur
gyi/ bdag rang gis ni ma yin no//
de bas na skye ba la ngo bo nyid
myed pa zhes bya'o//

yang dond dam gyung drung
'phags/ chos rnam gyi dond dam
pa la/ ngo bo myed pa gang zhe
na/ gang 'di ltar chos rnam gyi/
skye ba la ngo bo nyid myed pas
na'a ngo bo nyid myed pa ste/
rkyend dang 'du ba tshogs te
byung ba rnamso// dond dam pa

don dam yang dag 'phags de la chos
rnam kyi mtshan nyid ngo bo nyid
med pa nyid gang zhe na/ kun
brtags pa'i mtshan nyid gang yin
pa'o//

de ci'i phyir zhe na/ 'di ltar de ni
ming dang brdar rnam par bzhag
pa'i mtshan nyid yin gyi/ rang gi
mtshan nyid kyi rnam par gnas
pa ni ma yin pas de'i phyir de ni
mtshan nyid ngo bo nyid med pa
nyid ces bya'o//

don dam yang dag 'phags chos
rnam kyi skye ba gno bo nyid
med pa nyid gang zhe na/ chos
rnam kyi gzhan gyi dbang gi
mtshan nyid gang yin pa'o// de
ci'i phyir zhe na/ 'di ltar de ni
rkyen gzhan gyi stobs kyi byung
ba yin gyi/ bdag nyid kyi ni ma
yin pas de'i phyir skye ba ngo bo
nyid med pa nyid ces bya'o//

don dam yang dag 'phags chos
rnam kyi don dam pa ngo bo nyid
med pa nyid gang zhe na/ rten
cing 'brel par 'byung ba'i chos
gang dag skye ba ngo bo nyid med
pa nyid kyi ngo bo nyid med pa
de dag ni don dam pa'i ngo bo
nyid med pa nyid kyi ngo bo nyid

(12)

la ngo bo nyid myed pa'ang de'o// med pa yang yin no// (P. 18b1-5: L.
(No. 194, f. 37b4-No. 683, a3) pp. 67-68, VII, §4, 1. 1-§6, 1. 5)

List of the old Tib. tr. words equivalent to the new ones

1. Yang don(d) dam gyung drung 'phags: Don dam yang dag 'phags (Paramārthasamudgata); 2. mtshan nyid la ngo bo nyid myed pa: mtshan nyid ngo bo nyid med pa nyid (lakṣaṇa-niḥsvabhāvatā); 3. skye ba la ngo bo nyid myed pa: skye ba ngo bo nyid med pa nyid (utpatti-niḥsvabhāvatā); 4. dond dam pa la ngo bo nyid myed pa: don dam pa ngo bo nyid med pa nyid (paramārtha-niḥsvabhāvatā); 5. bdagi mtshan ma nyid: rang gi mtshan nyid (sva-lakṣaṇa); 6. gzhan gyi rkyend gyi dbang: rkyen gzhan gyi stobs (para-pratyaya-bala); 7. rkyend dang 'du ba tshogs te byung ba: rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba (pratityasamutpanna)

[玄奘譯] 善男子，云何諸法相無自性性，謂諸法遍計所執相。何以故。此由假名安立爲相，非由自相安立爲相。是故說名，相無自性性。云何諸法生無自性性，謂諸法依他起相。何以故。此由依他緣力故有，非自然有。是故諸名，生無自性性。云何諸法勝義無自性性，謂諸法由生無自性性故，說名無自性性，卽緣生法，亦名勝義無自性性。(大正16, 694a)

[菩提流支譯] 成就第一義，諸法無自體相者，諸分別相。何以故。以彼諸法隨名相說，非有自體。是故我言，無自體相。成就第一義，何者諸法無生體相，謂諸法無體相。何以故。以彼法生依他力因緣，非自體相。是故我說，無生體相。成就第一義，何者是第一義無體相，成就第一義，第一義無體相者，一切諸法本無生體。是故我說，一切諸法無自體相，以彼依於因緣生故，(以依第一義無體相故)。(大正16, 670c)

Example 7

rtag pa yun du rtag pa/ brtan ba	rtag pa rtag pa'i dus dang/ ther
yun du brtan bar/ chos nyid nyid	zug ther zug gi dus su chos nyid
kyis 'dug pa ste 'dus ma byas pa'o/	de nyid kyis rnam par gnas pa
de ma skyes pa'o/ de ma bgags	'dus ma byas pa gang yin pa de
'dus ma byas pa'i phyir/	ni 'dus ma byas pa'i phyir ma
de thog ma nas zhi ba/ rang bzhin	skyes pa dang ma 'gags pa yin la/
[gyis] ⁹⁾ mya ngan las 'das pa ste/	de ni nyon mongs pa thams cad
mya ngan thams chad (la) dang	dang bral ba'i phyir gzod ma nas

'bral ba'i phyir ro// (No. 194, f. 56a1 -2) zhi ba dang/ rang bzhin gyis yongs
su mya ngan las 'das pa yin te/
(P. 19b3-4: L. p. 70, VII, §9, 11. 9-14)

List of the old Tib. tr. words equivalent to the new ones

1. rtag pa yun du rtag pa: rtag pa rtag pa'i dus (nityaṃ nitya-kālam)¹⁰⁾;
2. brtan ba yun du brtan bar: ther zug ther zug gi dus su (dhruvaṃ dhruva-kālam)¹⁰⁾;
3. thog ma nas zhi ba: gzod ma nas zhi ba (ādi-śānta);
4. rang bzhin gyis mya ngan las 'das pa: rang bzhin gyis yongs su mya ngan las 'das pa (prakṛti-parinirvṛta)

玄奘譯 於常常時，於恒恒時，諸法法性安住故，無爲。由無爲故，無生，無滅。一切雜染不相應故，本來寂靜，自性涅槃。(大正16, 694b)

菩提流支譯 若法常常時，恒恒時，依彼法體住，彼法不生不滅，以無爲故。若法本來寂靜，彼法本來涅槃，以遠離一切煩惱毒相應故。(大正16, 671a)

As a result of the above comparison, we know that the vocabularies in Stein Tib. Nos. 194 and 683 agree with the old Tibetan translation words as pointed out by S. Harada¹¹⁾. Some of these words are the same as those found in the Tibetan translations from the Chinese Buddhist texts¹²⁾. However, the manuscript of Stein Tib. Nos. 194 and 683 is not considered to have been re-translated from any of the Chinese versions of this sūtra, because it is impossible to suppose that the words, Shin du rnam par dag par *bye brag phyed pa* (Ex. 3, List 1) and Yangs pa *bye brag phyed pa* (Ex. 4, List 3), for example, were re-translated

9) The word gyis should be supplemented acc. to No. 194, f. 37a2 and f. 56a4.

10) Lamotte's reconstruction is nitya-kālam śāśvata-kālam. But it should be corrected into nityaṃ nitya-kālam dhruvaṃ dhruva-kālam acc. to the Skt. text of the *Byams zhus kyi le'u* (Refer to N. Hakamaya, "A Japanese Translation of the *Byams zhus kyi le'u*", *Komazawa Daigaku Bukkyō Gakubu Ronshū*, No. 6 (1975), p. 197, n. 51).

11) Harada, *op. cit.*, p. 5.

12) Refer to Daishun Ueyama, "On the Tibetan Translation of the 楞伽師資記", *Bukkyō Bunken no Kenkyū*, (Kyoto, 1968), pp. 191-209, and "A Study of the Tibetan Translation of the 頓悟真宗要決", *Zenbunka Kenkyūsho Kiyō*, No. 8 (1976), pp. 33-103.

(14)

from 善清淨慧 (淨慧) and 廣慧¹³⁾. Also, we do not consider it a re-translation because the style of Stein Nos. 194 and 683 is the most closely allied to that of the Tibetan equivalent text preserved in the extant bKa' 'gyur. Therefore, we think that both the old and new Tibetan versions were based on a common Sanskrit original, or that the version represented by Stein Nos. 194 and 683 was emended into the bKa' 'gyur version according to the rules of *skad gsar bcad*¹⁴⁾.

At any rate, it is certain that the manuscript of Stein Nos. 194 and 683 keeps the old translation form based on the Sanskrit original text, which belongs to the same group as the old Tibetan translations of the *Ratnamegha-sūtra*, *Akṣayamati-nirdeśa-sūtra*, *Vimalakīrti-nirdeśa-sūtra* and the first *Bhāvanākrama*¹⁵⁾.

d) Pelliot Tib. No. 1257: A Glossary of the
Old Tibetan Translations

Though Pelliot Tib. No. 1257, pp. 4–10 is a Tibetan-Chinese glossary as reported by M. Lalou¹⁶⁾, the Tibetan words seem to have been

13) The Sanskrit of Yangs pa *bye brag phyed pa* and 廣慧 is known as *Viśālamati* through the quotation in the *Triṃśikā*, p. 33, l. 26. It is confirmed that the Sanskrit word *mata* is translated into *bye brag phyed pa* by Ye shes sde while the same word is translated into *rtogs pa* by dPal brtsegs who is the younger contemporary of Ye shes sde (Refer to Hakamaya, "A Japanese Translation of the Last Chapter of the *Mahāyānasūtrālmkārāṭikā*", *Komazawa Daigaku Bukkyōgakubu Kenkyūkiyō*, No. 41, 1983, p. 448). With regard to the differences between Ye shes sde's and dPal brtsegs' terminology, see Hakamaya, "The *Chos kyī sku la gnas pa'i yon tan la bstod pa* and Its Related Materials" (in Japanese), *Komazawa Daigaku Bukkyōgakubu Ronshū*, No. 14 (1983).

14) The *dGongs pa nges par 'grel pa*, the title of the new translation, is listed in the *lDan dkar ma* (Lalou, No. 117), and it is said to have been emended by Ye shes sde according to Bu ston (Nishioka, No. 189).

15) Refer to Harada, *op. cit.*, p. 5 and p. 6. With regard to the old Tibetan translation of the *Vimalakīrti-nirdeśa-sūtra*, refer to J. W. de Jong, "Fonds Pelliot Tibétain Nos. 610 et 611" and "Encore Une Fois le Fonds Pelliot Tibétain No. 610", *Buddhist Studies*, pp. 431–445.

16) M. Lalou, *op. cit.*, II (1947), p. 94. Daishun Ueyama regards this as a Sino-

collected from the old Tibetan translations such as the ones mentioned above, while the Chinese words, some of which are omitted, do not seem to be more than additional notes given to the Tibetan.

It is worth noticing that the Tibetan words, especially on pp. 4 to 5, seem to have been extracted from the same Tibetan text of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra* as that represented by Stein Nos. 194 and 683. The words in Pelliot Tib. No. 1257, p. 4, for example, nan gyis reg ching chags, sgyus byas pa, myig 'khrul pa (11.2-3), zil gyis myi non par 'gyur (1.5), rtag pa yun du rtag pa, brtan ba yun du brtan ba, thog ma nas zhi ba, and rang bzhin gyis mya ngan las 'das pa (11.8-9) agree with those in Ex. 1, List, 6, 1, 2, Ex. 2, List, 1, Ex. 7, List, 1, 2, 3, 4 of Stein No. 194 respectively. The Bodhisattvas' names peculiar to the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra* such as Rigs par kun 'dri ba, Chos gyis 'phags and Yon tan 'byung gnas (which correspond to Tshul bzhin kun 'dri, Chos 'phags and Yon tan 'byung gnas in the new tr. respectively) are also listed in this glossary, p. 5, 1. 11, and they agree with those of the old translation of this sūtra, Stein No. 194, f. 46, 11. 4-5.

The words enumerated on other pages of this glossary also keep the old translation form. The Tibetan equivalents to the three lakṣaṇas and the three niḥsvabhāvatās (kun du rtogs pa'i mtshan nyid, gzhan gyi dbang las mtshan nyid, yongs su rdzogs pa'i mtshan nyid, mtshan nyid la ngo bo nyid myed pa, skye ba la ngo bo nyid myed pa and don dam pa la ngo bo nyid myed pa) in this glossary, p. 10, 11. 4-5 are the same as those of Ex. 5, List, 2, 3, 4, Ex. 6, List, 2, 3, 4 of Stein Nos. 194 and 683. The four words in this glossary, p. 8, 11. 3-4, 'od 'phro ba, shin tu dka' rgyal, mngon du ba and dge ba'i blo gros among the ten bhūmis, are the same as those four in Pelliot, Tib.

Tibetan glossary compiled in the process of development into the *Bye brag tu rtogs par byed pa (Mahāvvyutpatti)*, but he does not judge it clearly to be a glossary collected from the old Tibetan translations (Refer to his article, "A Study of the Tibetan translation of the 頓悟真宗要決", *op. cit.*, p. 47).

(16)

No. 842, which S. Harada considers as keeping the old Tibetan form¹⁷⁾.

Therefore, there is no doubt that Pelliot Tib. No.1257, pp.4 to 10 is a glossary of the old Tibetan translations, though it is to be noted that this glossary contains both Tibetan equivalents to tathāgata: de bzhin gshegs pa (the new one, p.5,1.4) and yang dag par gshegs pa (the old one, p.6,1.3), and that it gives only the new Tibetan equivalent bya ba nan tan gyi ye shes (p.9,1.2) to kṛtyānuṣṭhāna-jñāna, which almost agrees with the *Bye brag tu rtogs par byed pa* (*Mahāvvyutpatti*), No.114¹⁸⁾.

e) Conclusion and Remaining Problems

Tibet officially set about the work of translating Buddhist texts after A.D.779 when the six men of trial (sad mi mi drug) were ordained as Buddhist monks¹⁹⁾. This work was continued during the reign of the King Khri song lde brtsan (742-797), and it is considered that a kind of translation system was established to some extent during this period. Some Buddhist texts were translated into Tibetan according to the system which we call the old Tibetan translation. This system and some Tibetan Buddhist texts which were translated under this system are considered to have been brought into Tun-huang after it was occupied by Tibet (786)²⁰⁾. Pelliot Tib. No.1257, a glossary of the old Tibetan translations, reflects such a system, and the manuscript of Stein Tib. Nos.194 and 683, an old Tibetan translation of the *Samdhinirmocana-*

17) S. Harada, "The Philosophy of Mahāyāna Buddhism as Seen in the Tibetan Manuscripts from Tun-huang" (in Japanese), II, *Indogaku Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū*, Vol. 29, No. 1 (1980), p. 392.

18) The *Bye brag tu rtogs par byed pa* (*Mahāvvyutpatti*) (No.114) gives the Tibetan equivalent bya ba nan tan du grub pa'i ye shes to kṛtyānuṣṭhāna-jñāna, while the *sGra sbyor bam po gnyis pa* (P. ed., No. 5833, Ngo, 6b7: Pelliot Tib. No. 845, 3b2) gives bya ba grub/bsgrub pa'i ye shes. It is to be noted that Ye shes sde and dPal brtsegs followed the latter in this case.

19) Z. Yamaguchi, "A Chronological Research. . .", *op. cit.* pp. 5-6.

20) Z. Yamaguchi, "The Tibetan Occupation Period of Tun-huang" (in Japanese), *Tonkō no Rekishi*, (Tokyo, 1980), pp. 197-198.

sūtra, is one of those Tibetan texts. In A.D. 814, the new Tibetan translation system, *skad gsar bcad*, was established in Tibet, and after that it extended to Tun-huang. The existence of both old and new Tibetan translations in the Tun-huang manuscripts proves that both were used.

Now we have the *Bye brag tu rtogs par byed pa* (*Mahāvīyutpatti*) and the *sGra sbyor bam po gnyis pa* as the glossaries for the new Tibetan translations. With regard to the old Tibetan translations, however, only a few manuscripts have been available. We now have about 42 percent of the old Tibetan translation of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra* which has an abundance of Buddhist technical terms. The Tibetan words obtained from it are useful for distinguishing between the old and new Tibetan usages, or between the translations from Sanskrit and Chinese, just as they were used to determine whether Pelliot Tib. No. 1257 was an old or new translation. Furthermore, they may help to trace the stages in the development of early Tibetan translations. In order to facilitate this, it is necessary for us to make a glossary collected from the old Tibetan translations compared with the new ones on the basis of the index to the old and new translations of the *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra*.

(August 22, 1983)